



Administrative Report

Office of the Director of Infrastructure Services

To: Warden Tom Bain and Members of County Council

**From: Tom Bateman, P.Eng
Director of Infrastructure Services/County Engineer**

Date: February 7, 2018

Subject: County Road 42/43 Detailed Design – Consultant Selection

Report #: 2018-R002-IS-0207-TRB

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide County Council information and recommendations pertaining to the selection and award of consulting engineering professional services to complete Detailed Design (DD) for the following:

1. County Road 43 Diversion, as per the CR 43 / Banwell Road Class Environmental Assessment Study, 2009 (CR 43 EA). An interim 2-lane rural cross-section with multi-use trail is also to be designed for this portion.
2. County Road 42 from the City of Windsor (COW) boundary easterly to just east of the Pike Creek Bridge located approximately 260 metres east of the CR 42 / CR 19 intersection, including the proposed roundabout intersections at CR 42/43 and CR 42/19.

Background

The Environmental Assessment for the County Road 43 corridor was completed in 2009 and provided the opportunity to establish the location of future intersection roads that would be built as a component of development as well as a recommended 'jog elimination' by realigning the roadways

Page 2
February 7, 2018
Detailed Design, CR 42/43 – Consultant Selection

The Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for the County Road 42 corridor was completed in 2014 as a joint undertaking with the Ministry of Transportation and the City of Windsor.

The project includes the design of two (2) new intersection treatments for CR 43/CR 42; and CR 42/CR 19 which are recommended to be a 2-lane roundabout.

Discussion

The County of Essex engages its Engineering Consultants utilizing a “Quality Based Selection” process (QBS). This process recognizes that Professional Engineering Services are not a commodity that is best procured by a lowest price selection. The QBS process is endorsed by Professional Engineers Ontario, Consulting Engineers Ontario and several national organizations. The County of Essex has created a Professional Services Engineering Roster and distributed the request for proposal for this assignment to each of the qualified firms. Proposals were received from:

- Dillon Consulting
- Stantec Consulting
- WSP Consulting

The proposals were evaluated based on technical and financial criteria established in the Request for Proposals. This allocation ensures the assignment is awarded to the most technically competent consultant that demonstrates their ability to deliver the project under the Terms of Reference established in the RFP. The proposal with the highest combined technical and financial score is recommended for award of this assignment.

A consultant selection team of staff from the Infrastructure Services Department conducted a comprehensive review of all of the submissions against the Terms of Reference and it was found that all Proponents presented appropriate approaches to the work plan.

Each Proposal was evaluated as follows:

1. Understanding of the Assignment **[15 Points]**
2. Consultant Team **[10 Points]**
3. Approach and Methodology **[25 Points]**
4. Communication and Issue Resolution Strategies **[5 Points]**
5. Quality Assurance/Quality Control (QA/QC) **[5 Points]**
6. Proposed Schedule, Project Fee, Cost Control Procedures **[30 Points]**
7. Overall Quality of the Proposal **[10 Points]**

The evaluation was based on 70% (technical/management) and 30% (fee and level of effort) to ensure the assignment is awarded to the most

Administrative Report

Page 4

February 7, 2018

Detailed Design, CR 42/43 – Consultant Selection

technically competent Proponent that demonstrates their ability to deliver the project.

The proposals received included a level of effort ranging from approximately 5,800 to 10,000 hours of dedicated staff time and total fees ranging from \$890,000 to \$1.7 million plus HST. A comprehensive review of all of the submissions was completed against the Terms of Reference and the selection team was satisfied with each of the firms' qualifications to complete this assignment however it was determined that all Proponents presented differing approaches to the work plan. This has made the evaluation process difficult and therefore, a request to each Proponent was presented to pursue a formal interview process to present each firm's proposed workplan and to address questions and/or concerns from the selection team.

Based on a combination of scores received on the written submission and the formal interview process, the selection Committee ranked the firms in order of qualification. The Selection Committee only used those criteria published in the Request for Proposal (RFP) in making their determinations. All Proponents will be accorded fair and equal treatment.

Staff from the Infrastructure Services Department evaluated the proposals and determined that Dillon Consulting is the preferred proponent to complete this assignment. The Dillon Consulting proposal best met the submission requirements identified in the terms of reference and addresses all the requirements for this assignment, including qualified and knowledgeable personnel and a sound methodology to complete the design assignment.

The Dillon submission included a level of effort of 6,519 hours and total fee of \$998,636, plus H.S.T.

Funds to undertake this assignment are provided in the 2018 budget allocated from the Roadway Expansion Reserve. In accordance with the County's Purchasing Bylaw, agreements of this value require approval of County Council and execution by the Warden and Clerk. The agreement will be based on the Professional Engineers Ontario or Consulting Engineers Ontario standard service provision agreement.

The County Road 42 capacity expansion program from the City of Windsor limits to County Road 19 will be undertaken in 5 construction phases. It is programmed to start in 2019 with utility relocations followed by annual construction projects with an estimated value of \$36 million.

Administrative Report

Page 5

February 7, 2018

Detailed Design, CR 42/43 – Consultant Selection

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Warden and Clerk be authorized to execute an agreement with Dillon Consulting for the provision of consulting engineering services to complete the detailed design for County Road 42 and County Road 43.

Respectfully Submitted

Tom Bateman

Originally Signed by

Tom Bateman P.Eng, Director of Infrastructure Services/County Engineer

Concurred With,

Robert Maisonville

Originally Signed by

Robert Maisonville, Chief Administrative Officer