



County of Essex
Administrative Report
Office of the Chief, Essex-Windsor Emergency Medical Services

To: Warden Tom Bain and Members of County Council

From: Bruce Krauter, Acting Chief
Essex Windsor EMS

Date: April 16, 2014

Subject: Request for Proposal AMB 01-14

Report #: 2014-R004-EMS-0416-BK

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide County Council information and recommendations pertaining to the selection and award for the design, construct and supply of up to thirty five (35+-) Type III Ambulances over a five (5) year period, beginning 2014 and ending 2018. Included in the 2014 EMS budget is the requirement for seven (7) ambulances and projected eight (8) ambulances for January/February 2015.

Background

On November 20, 2013, the County of Essex Director of Corporate Services/Treasurer presented the **County of Essex - Asset Management Plan**, Report # 2013-R19-FIN-1120-RM. As a condition of future provincial funding, municipalities are required to develop an Asset Management Plan that will identify how assets are planned for, funded and managed over their lifecycle.

The EMS department has a current fleet of 38 front of line ambulances, 12 emergency response vehicles, 1 logistics vehicle, 1 administration vehicle, 1 special operations trailer, 1 hazmat trailer and an off-road transport vehicle. This report will concentrate on the ambulance fleet only.

In consultation with the Treasurer, Essex Windsor EMS developed an asset Management Plan for the current fleet of Ambulances. Based on the calculation of in-service date and a Useful Life of six (6) years, it was determined that the following number of ambulances should be replaced over the next five years.

| Year | Number of Ambulances |
|-------------|-----------------------------|
| 2014 | 7 |
| 2015 | 8 |
| 2016 | 8 |
| 2017 | 5 |
| 2018 | 3 |

Analysis of the current fleet found that seven (7) ambulances either meet or exceed the determined six (6) year Useful Life expectancy or exceed over 250,000 km's, as of January 1, 2014. Historical analysis and experience of fleet maintenance records indicates that as an ambulance's mileage and lifespan increases, vehicle repair, maintenance and down time expenses increase.

The following vehicles, including model year and mileage, are identified for replacement in 2014

| Number | Model Year | Mileage |
|--------|------------|---------|
| 1143 | 2006 | 276,274 |
| 1121 | 2006 | 343,820 |
| 1109 | 2006 | 326,159 |
| 1110 | 2006 | 264,759 |
| 1148 | 2006 | 266,739 |
| 1113 | 2007 | 256,631 |
| 1149 | 2007 | 249,090 |

The replacement proposal for 2015 to 2018 is projected. Annually, and part of the proposed EMS budget, ambulance fleet data will be analyzed to determine the actual ambulance replacement needs and requirements.

The seven (7) ambulances proposed for 2014 are included in the 2014 EMS budget.

On January 2014, the County of Essex issued a Request for Proposal, AMB 01-14 which was publically advertised. The RFP conforms to the County of Essex Purchasing Policy, #04-002. RFP AMB 01-14 secures pricing for the County of Essex for a period from 2014 to 2018 for the design, construction and supply of ambulances.

Discussion

Proposals were received from:

- Crestline Coach Ltd.
- Malley Industries Inc.

The proposals were evaluated based on financial, conformity with the proposal requirements, warranties and proposal experience/quality of references.

This evaluation ensures the project is awarded to the most technically competent manufacturer and supplier that demonstrate their ability to deliver the ambulances under the Terms of Reference established in the RFP. The proposal with the highest combined technical and financial score is recommended for award of this assignment.

The following are the comparators for the RFP on a per unit basis

| Evaluation | | Crestline | Malley |
|------------|------|---|---|
| Financial | 2014 | \$143,590 (plus HST) Chassis and Conversion, optional medication cooler/heater included | \$145,666 (plus HST) Chassis and Conversion, optional medication cooler/heater included |
| | 2015 | \$145,689 (plus HST) Chassis and Conversion, optional medication cooler/heater included | \$145,666 (plus HST) Chassis and Conversion, optional medication cooler/heater included |
| | 2016 | \$111,122 Base Conversion only | \$109,138 Base Conversion only |

| Evaluation | | Crestline | Malley |
|---|------|--|--|
| Financial | 2017 | \$113,503 Base Conversion only | \$109,825 Base Conversion only |
| | 2018 | \$115,828 Base Conversion only | \$112,040 Base Conversion only |
| Conformity | | Meets or exceeds all requirements | Does not meet all requirements |
| Warranties | | Standard | Optional purchase |
| Experience/Quality of References | | Vendor of EWEMS for past 10 years | No Ontario references |

Specific to the Evaluation criteria the following was found

Conformity and Experience

- a)** Malley Industries Inc. quoted a 139 inch wheel base unit which did not meet the requirements of the RFP. From past experience, this type of vehicle results in a rougher ride for patients, less storage space for equipment and decreased fuel economy.
- b)** Malley Industries Inc. quoted a colour matched, 8 step water based epoxy system with an acid pre-treat for the exterior paint. This method does not meet the requirements of the RFP. From past experience, this method will require repair in approximately three to four years at a projected cost of \$3,000 per unit.
- c)** Malley Industries Inc. state that although their units have completed the MOH & LTC Certification, they are awaiting final delivery of the certification.

Warranty

Crestline Coach Ltd. honours the requirement of the RFP with a 6 year/250,000 km warranty in the standard pricing. Malley Industries Inc. will honour the requirement of the specified warranty with an optional price increase.

In accordance with the County's Purchasing Bylaw, acquisitions of this value require approval of County Council and execution by the Warden and Clerk. The requirements of the RFP meet the Ontario Provincial Land Ambulance & Emergency Response Vehicle Standard, Version 5.0 issued by the Ministry of Health and Long Term Care, Emergency Health Services Branch. Funds for this purchase are allocated in the 2014 EMS budget.

Recommendation

It is the recommendation of Administration that Crestline Coach Ltd. be awarded the contract for the supply of seven (7) ambulances for 2014; and

That RFP AMB-01-14 will be utilized for Ambulance purchases in the subsequent years 2015 up to and including 2018; and further

That the Warden and Clerk be authorized to execute the purchase agreement with Crestline Coach Ltd., on the terms and conditions set out in RFP AMB-01-04.

Respectfully Submitted

Concurred With,

Bruce Krauter

Brian Gregg

Originally signed by Bruce Krauter
Acting Chief,
Essex Windsor EMS

Originally signed by Brian Gregg
Chief Administrative Officer